



**Marin Municipal Water District  
Board of Directors**

ITEM No.: 6

MEETING DATE:  
6/24/2009

SUBJECT: Proposal for Classification and Compensation Study Contract

SUBMITTED BY: Mark Williamson, Human Resources Manager  
Human Resources Division

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approve awarding contact to conduct classification and compensation study to Koff & Associates

SUMMARY:

Background – MMWD has approximately 260 employees, occupying at least 125 separate currently-used job titles and had its last overall classification review decades ago, reportedly in the early 1960's. Individual job descriptions have been created and modified over the years as needed, and pay rates set to meet each individual situation. However, because of changes within the district, the industry and the overall labor market in the intervening years, the District's current classification system is not adequate and needs to be updated.

For several years, the job classifications, the internal relationships between similar - and dissimilar - jobs, have been an issue of discussion between the District and the union. Continued activity in this area on a piecemeal basis often only postpones issues. Also, performing the classification study and preparatory work now will prepare for work that is already scheduled via the current CBA (section 10.5):

Commencing July 1, 2010, or earlier by mutual agreement, and prior to conducting new surveys, the Union and the District shall meet to review the structure of the current survey benchmarks, including benchmark classes and the assignment of non-benchmark classes.

In recognition of this need, a comprehensive classification and compensation study was authorized in 2007 and went as far as an RFP and the receipt of proposals, though that project was postponed for budgetary considerations. The current (08-09) budget has funds allocated for the study and, if approved, would begin in the near future.

An updated and comprehensive review would provide:

- A consistent organizational framework and clear career paths for succession planning.
- Legally compliant (including FLSA and ADA requirements) documentation.

- Internally alignment of classifications (between positions, both similar and dissimilar).
- Classifications that are reflective of contemporary industry standards for job titles, duties and qualifications and accurately reflect current roles, responsibilities, duties.
- Clearer relationships to established industry benchmarks for comparative surveys.

The final product will be an integrated classification plan, reflecting an organizational structure that will allow the District operate into the future, allow career growth for employees, and allow the District to continue to deliver effective customer service.

The study process includes orientation and briefing sessions with employees, management, and union representatives; the completion of a Position Description Questionnaire by employees; interviews with at least a representative sample of employees in each study class; and interviews with managers and department heads to address any classification issues. Draft classification descriptions will be developed and sent back to management and incumbents for additional feedback and concurrence before finalizing. The collective bargaining agreement requires union review and comment for changes to job descriptions so their participation in and agreement with the process is a key factor.

Process of securing proposals - RFP's were distributed to seven organizations who had initially bid on the project in 2007 and were familiar with the District's needs. Experience with both public agencies, utilities and specifically water districts was noted as a requirement. Proposals received were (listed alphabetically):

1. CPS Human Resource Services (\$83,185).
2. Fox Lawson & Associates (\$78,000)
3. Johnson & Associates (\$79,690)
4. Koff & Associates (\$76,325)
5. Nash & Company, Inc. ((\$81,700)
6. Public Sector Personnel Consultants (\$82,500)
7. Renne Sloan Holtzman & Sakai, LLP (\$140,000)

All proposals were reviewed by Human Resources staff and two consultants were brought in for presentations. The recommended provider for the survey was # 4, Koff and Associates. They are based in Emeryville and have extensive experience with Bay Area governments, including special districts (see attachment B). Their bid was also the lowest and their presentation on their methodology and project management skills very effective. Positive references were also received from prior clients. The schedule for the project is flexible, but is planned as:

Classification Study – Phase I (July thru October)

1. Contract Award
2. Questionnaires to District for Review
3. Initial Start-up/Orientation Meetings

4. Questionnaires Returned to Our Office
5. Questionnaire Review
6. Employee/Management Interviews
7. Classification Concept Development
8. Review by District
9. Class Description Development
10. District Review of Class Specs/Follow-up
11. Final Class Descriptions and Class Report

Compensation Study (Benchmarking and Matching Process) – Phase II (July thru December)

1. Comparators and Benchmark Classes
2. Identification of Appropriate Classification Matches in the Identified Labor Market
3. District Review of Classification Matches
4. K&A Reanalysis/Feedback
5. Interim Class & Comp Report
6. Final Reports
7. Final Presentation(s)

Compensation Study (Collection and Input of Actual Salary Data) – Phase III (Summer 2010)

1. Collection of Salary Data and Development of Data Spreadsheets
2. Internal Position Evaluation/Review
3. Development of Salary Schedules and Alternative Compensation
4. Implementation Strategy Development
5. Interim Class & Comp Report
6. Final Reports
7. Final Presentation(s)

Compensation Study (Update of Salary Data) – Phase IV (not included in initial contract)

1. Update of Salary Data - Beginning of 2011. (either internally or on time-and-materials basis by K&A)

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment A – Reference from collective bargaining agreements.  
Attachment B – Koff & Associates client list.

## Attachment A – Reference from collective bargaining agreements.

### Reference in 2003-2008 CBA

#### 10.5 Classification Review

During the term of this contract the District and the Union shall establish a procedure for requesting a classification review

---

### References in current CBA:

#### 3.5.1

The Labor Management Committee may review and recommend classifications or positions to be studied.

In the first 180 days following ratification of the CBA the Labor Management Committee shall review the following classes or class series and make recommendations for further study, if any, which may include revisions to class descriptions, referral for benchmark evaluation or other appropriate modifications.

- Accountant Series
- Backflow Specialist
- Engineering Technician
- Maintenance Worker III/Welder
- Utility Worker III /Valve Tech.
- Watershed Park Ranger

In the event modifications to classes or class series listed above take place, the Labor Management Committee will be noticed and will be provided with an opportunity for ongoing input into the process.

---

#### 10.5 Classification Review

In the first 180 days following ratification of this CBA, the District shall begin to review the following classes or class series:

- Drafting Technician
- Information Systems Analyst Series
- Meter Operations Coordinator
- Safety Trainer

The District may conduct organization wide classification studies during the term of this CBA. In the case that such studies are conducted, the Labor Management Committee shall be noticed, and will be provided with an opportunity for ongoing input into the process.

Commencing July 1,2010, or earlier by mutual agreement, and prior to conducting new surveys, the Union and the District shall meet to review the structure of the current survey benchmarks, including benchmark classes and the assignment of non-benchmark classes.

## Attachment B – Koff & Associates client list.

### CITIES

ALAMEDA, BELLFLOWER, CAPITOLA, CITRUS HEIGHTS, COACHELLA, EL CERRITO, EUREKA, FORTUNA  
FREMONT , GALT, GREENFIELD, HAYWARD, INDIAN WELLS, LYNWOOD, MALIBU, MILL VALLEY, MISSION VIEJO, MONTEREY,  
NAPA, NATIONAL CITY, NEWMAN, ORANGE ,ORINDA, PASO ROBLES, PATTERSON  
PERRIS, PIEDMONT, PINOLE, PLEASANTON, POWAY, RICHMOND, RIO VISTA, ROCKLIN, SACRAMENTO, SAN JUAN BAUTISTA,  
SAN LUIS OBISPO, SANTA ROSA, SOLEDAD, STOCKTON, TIGARD, OR, TRACY, TWENTYNINE PALMS, WALNUT CREEK, TOWN  
OF APPLE VALLEY.

### COUNTIES

ALAMEDA HOUSING AUTHORITY, BUTTE, CONTRA COSTA, MARIN, MARIN HOUSING AUTHORITY, MERCED, PLACER, TEHAMA.

### SPECIAL DISTRICTS

ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY  
ALAMEDA COUNTY WATER DISTRICT  
BAY AREA WATER SUPPLY & CONSERVATION AGENCY  
BUTTE AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
CALAVERAS COUNTY WATER DISTRICT  
CARMEL AREA WASTEWATER DISTRICT  
CARPINTERIA SANITARY DISTRICT  
CASTRO VALLEY SANITARY DISTRICT  
CENTRAL CONTRA COSTA SANITARY DISTRICT  
CENTRAL CONTRA COSTA SOLID WASTE AUTHORITY  
COASTSIDE WATER DISTRICT  
CONTRA COSTA COUNTY RETIREMENT ASSOCIATION  
CONTRA COSTA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY  
EAST BAY MUNICIPAL UTILITY DISTRICT  
EAST PALO ALTO SANITARY DISTRICT  
FAIRFIELD-SUISUN SANITARY DISTRICT  
FEATHER RIVER AQMD  
GOLETA SANITARY DISTRICT  
GREATER LA COUNTY VECTOR CONTROL DISTRICT  
HEALTH PLAN OF SAN MATEO  
IRONHOUSE SANITARY DISTRICT  
LAKE ARROWHEAD CSD  
LAS GALLINAS VALLEY SANITARY DISTRICT  
MARINA COAST WATER DISTRICT  
MENDOCINO COAST DISTRICT HOSPITAL  
METROPOLITAN TRANSIT COMMISSION  
MID-PENINSULA WATER DISTRICT

MONTEREY REGIONAL WASTE MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
NAPA SANITATION DISTRICT  
NIPOMO COMMUNITY SERVICES DISTRICT  
NOVATO SANITARY DISTRICT  
OJAI VALLEY SANITARY DISTRICT  
PALOS VERDES LIBRARY DISTRICT  
PENINSULA TRAFFIC CONGESTION RELIEF ALLIANCE  
PLACENTIA LIBRARY DISTRICT  
SAN RAMON VALLEY FIRE DISTRICT  
SANITARY DISTRICT NO. 5 OF MARIN COUNTY  
SANTA CLARA VALLEY WATER DISTRICT  
SAUSALITO–MARIN CITY SANITARY DISTRICT  
SOLANO COUNTY WATER AGENCY  
SOLANO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY  
SOUTH COAST AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
SOUTH COAST WATER DISTRICT  
STATE WATER CONTRACTORS  
STEGE SANITARY DISTRICT  
TIBURON SANITARY DISTRICT  
TRINITY PUD  
TRUCKEE DONNER PUD  
TRUCKEE SANITARY DISTRICT  
WEST BAY SANITARY DISTRICT  
WEST COUNTY WASTEWATER DISTRICT  
WESTERN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY TRANSIT  
AUTHORITY